

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: OCTOBER 23, 2014

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, October 23, 2014. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, Mr. Robert Braddock, Vice-Chair, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal. Commission staff present included Ms. Georgetta Kelly, Civil Service Secretary, Ms. Nancy Olind, Assistant Human Resources Director, and Ms. Seeta Martindale, Recording Secretary.

AGENDA ITEMS

APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 10/09/2014 MEETING. Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner Braddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner McNeal seconded the motion, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:

Brian Hurd to the position of Public Works Inspector 1 in the Department of Transportation and Engineering. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Hurd meets the minimum requirements for the position, completed the exam process, meets the needs of the department, and was selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Casey Patterson to the position of Automotive Mechanic in the Public Services Department. This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Patterson meets the minimum requirements for the position, completed the exam process, meets the needs of the department, and was selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Felicia Hodges and Zachary Scott to full-time Sanitation Helpers in the Public Services Department. Ms. Hodges and Mr. Scott meet the qualifications for the position and were selected by the employing unit based on their seniority within the collective bargaining guidelines. This item was approved by the Commission.

Nosakhare Ekahator to the position of Human Resources Analyst in the Human Resources Department. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Ekahator meets the minimum qualifications for the position and the specialized characteristics suited to the Department. The Commission approved the suspension of the competitive process, in this instance, due to the confidential nature of the position and the unique qualifications required by the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Phil Sibert to the position of Chemist in the Water Works Department. Candidates for this position were evaluated utilizing the Training and Experience Eligibility Criteria with all required criteria verified by Staff prior to creating an eligible list. Mr. Sibert met the minimum qualifications for the position, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

Joseph Berling to the position of Chemist (Organics) in the Department of Sewers. Candidates for this position were evaluated utilizing the Training and Experience Eligibility Criteria with all required criteria verified by Staff prior to creating an eligible list. Mr. Berling met the minimum qualifications for the position, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive

Hassan Dawas to the position of Dentist in the Health Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional nature of the work, rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Dr. Dawas meets the minimum qualifications and possesses the specific skills needed by the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

Larry Whitaker to the position of Supervising Management Analyst (Human Resources) in the Public Services Department. This position was posted as a non-competitive appointment based on the professional nature of the work, rendering the competitive process impractical in this instance. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Whitaker meets the minimum qualifications, is currently serving in the position, and fulfills the specific needs of the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

PROMOTION WITHOUT EXAM:

Raymond Farrell to the position of Electrical Maintenance Worker 1 in the Water Works Department. Mr. Farrell meets the minimum requirements of the position and has successfully completed one year of City service as an Electrical Maintenance Helper as stated in the classification specification. The requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

Daniel Chandler to the position of Electrical Maintenance Worker 1 in the Water Works Department. Mr. Chandler meets the minimum requirements of the position and has successfully completed one year of City service as an Electrical Maintenance Helper as stated in the classification specification. The requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion

Donin Nixon to the position of Wastewater Collection Equipment Specialist in the Department of Sewers. Mr. Nixon successfully passed the Wastewater Collection Equipment Specialist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

Eddie Bishop to the position of Automotive Mechanic within the Public Services Department. Within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines, Mr. Bishop was placed in the position of Automotive Mechanic in the Public Services Department. This item was noted by the Commission.

John Davis Jr. to the position of Fire Lieutenant in the Fire Department. Mr. Davis successfully passed the Fire Lieutenant promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements of the position and was selected on the basis of being next in rank on the current Fire Lieutenant Eligible List. This item was noted by the Commission.

Rasmi Phillip to the position of Accounting Technician 3 in the Water Works Department. Ms. Phillip successfully passed the Accounting Technician 3 promotional examination and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

MINUTES cont'd...

Thomas Cucinotta to the position of Fire Captain in the Fire Department. Mr. Cucinotta successfully passed the Fire Captain promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements of the position and was selected on the basis of being next in rank on the current Fire Captain Eligible List. This item was noted by the Commission.

Jeremy Spurlock to the position of Water Works Valve Operator 2 in the Water Works Department. Mr. Spurlock successfully passed the Water Works Valve Operator 2 promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

Jeffrey Ficker to the position of Water Works Maintenance Worker in the Water Works Department. Mr. Ficker successfully passed the Water Works Maintenance Worker promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

Jamie Fleihman to the position of Water Works Maintenance Worker in the Water Works Department. Mr. Fleihman successfully passed the Water Works Maintenance Worker promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer

Brenda Dixon to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Enterprise Technology Solutions Department. Ms. Dixon meets the minimum qualifications for the position as listed on the approved Senior Administrative Specialist classification specification and all parties are agreeable to the transfer. This item has been approved by the Commission.

Charlotte Walton to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Water Works Department. Ms. Walton meets the minimum qualifications of the position as listed in the approved Administrative Specialist classification specification and all parties are agreeable to the transfer. This item was noted by the Commission.

NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Re-instatement

Re-instatement of Lydia Upchurch to the position of Operator Dispatcher in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communication Center Division. Based upon the results of a grievance process, a decision was reached to re-instate Ms. Upchurch to the position of Operator Dispatcher in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center Division. This item has been noted by the Commission.

ELIGIBLE LIST: Request for Approval

- a) Traffic Aids Worker (Article XX) – Promotional exam

The staff provided information pertaining to the eligible list and recommended approval. This item was approved and the list will be posted on the City's Website following exam review sessions, as needed.

MINUTES cont'd...

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Examination Schedule

Request from the Human Resources Department for approval of the Emergency Services Dispatch Supervisor Structural Oral Interviews between October 21–23, 2014. The staff recommended approval of the examination schedule.

Request for Commission determination on request for Alternate Exam Dates for Open-to-the-Public examinations. After review and discussion, the Commission's determination was to adhere to the rules.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Approval of PHQ

Request to approve the Personal History Questionnaire. The staff recommended approval of the updates to the Personal History Questionnaire used as a prerequisite to background investigations during the testing process for Police Recruit, Fire Recruit, and Assistant Operator Dispatcher. As such, it was stated that the Chief of Police and the Law Department had also reviewed and approved the updates to the PHQ. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Special Examiners

- a) Michael Schmidt, Rico Cosby and Jerry Corbett for the Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor exam
- b) Rebecca Vogler, Dave Durkin and Robert Schirhart for the Board of Education's Accountant exam
- c) Carol Smith, Jennifer Bailey and Lunette Baldwin for the Board of Education's Intermediate Accounting Technician exam

The staff recommended approval of the special examiners. These items were approved by the Commission.

CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications:

- a) Director of Citizens Complaint Authority
- b) Executive Project Director (Chief Performance Officer)
- c) Supervising Environmental/Safety Specialist

The staff recommended approval of the new/revised classification specifications. These classification specifications were approved by the Commission.

CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization:

- a) **City Planning and Buildings Department:** Add (1) Supervising City Planner and delete (1) Senior Community Development Analyst
- b) **Health Department:** Add (1) Dental Hygienist (0.8 FTE)

The staff supported its recommendations for approval of the add/delete positions by presenting budget and organizational information relating to each item and the items were approved.

APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items:

Appeal Hearing Schedule:

Name	Scheduled for:
Robert DeBonis	Scheduling Suspended/Appellant awaiting delivery of Public Records Material
Anthony Axle	Written Commission Decision to follow
Vinson Key	Continuance requested by Appellant on May 30, 2014/Contacted by Staff regarding re-scheduling
Jeff Stallworth	Staff contacted Appellant in the attempt to re-schedule Hearing date
Daryl Ross	On Hold/Law Dept. providing updates

The staff provided information on the current Appeal Hearing Schedule. The Commission noted this item.

APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:

Request from DeAndre Williams to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Parks/Recreation Maintenance Crew Leader (Non-Competitive). Mr. Williams was not present at the meeting. The staff recommended denial of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission denied the request. The decision was based on the fact that Mr. Williams does not have the time in grade for the specified classification listed on the job posting.

Request from Elvin Wade to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Cement Finisher. The staff recommended denial of the request. Mr. Wade was present at the meeting, presented his valid CDL driver's license before the Commission, and spoke on the situation surrounding his application experience. After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request. The decision was based upon the additional information provided by Mr. Wade.

Request from Nancy Shaw to re-appear before the Commission regarding the rejection of her application for the position of Traffic Aids Worker. Ms. Shaw was not present at the meeting. The staff confirmed that a second public records request from Ms. Shaw was fulfilled by HR Staff prior to the meeting, and maintained the recommendation to deny the request. After review and discussion, the Commission denied the request. The decision was based upon the fact that Ms. Shaw does not have the time in grade as stated in the required classification specification.

Request from Stephen Chapman to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Supervising Management Analyst (Human Resources). Mr. Chapman was not present at the meeting. The staff recommended denial of the request. After review and discussion, the Commission denied the request. The decision was based on the fact that Mr. Chapman did not provide the required documentation to substantiate the educational requirement for the position.

ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Speak Before Commission

Request from Jude Johnson to speak before the Commission regarding application and clarification of Civil Service Rule 10 § 10. Mr. Johnson was present at the meeting and spoke before the Commission relating to the matter of the application of Civil Service Rule 10 § 10 in relation to the temporary promotion for the Supervising Management Analyst position in the Public Services Department. The Commission took Mr. Johnson's comments under advisement and noted his concerns.

Request from Kelly Malone to speak before the Commission regarding training/promotion evaluations of promoted AFSCME employees. Ms. Malone was not present at the meeting.

Request from Maurice Brown to speak before the Commission regarding probationary periods and training opportunities as it pertains to AFSCME Union Bargaining Unit Agreement, Article 29. Mr. Brown was present at the meeting and spoke before the Commission in his official capacity as the President of AFSCME, Local 250 in regards to improvements/investment needed to develop official training programs to ensure employee health and safety issues. The Commission heard his comments and noted his concerns.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

Informational item on a Department of Justice request for information. Staff provided information and updates in regards to working with the Police Department, Law Department, and the Department of Justice to proactively address items related to adverse impact in public safety testing and hiring. Also, information was presented relating to a criterion study underway to evaluate candidates' success on the job in relation to testing performance. The Commission noted the updates.

Informational item on a proposed settlement agreement. Staff provided updated information to the Commission on settlement negotiations relating to current on-going grievances and a suit by Steve Kallay and the Cincinnati Organized and Dedicated Employees (CODE) union. The Commission noted the updates.

The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organized and Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5. CODE representatives were not at the meeting. All items were noted by the Commission as waived.